

Al-Powered Strategies to ACHIEVE Writing Proficiency

Jennifer Duncan jduncan@gsu.edu Moral & Ethical Considerations

The Disclaimers

Composition v. Creative Writing

No long-term research

LLMs, AI, and the Current Composition Situation

Even if it's not your fault, it's your responsibility.

— Terry Protehett —

AZQUOTES

My Pedagogical Principles

- Transparency
- Equity
- Critical Thinking & Reflection
- Scaffolded Learning
- Relevant Assignments

Transparency



The Class Policy



Clarity in Assignment Instructions



Disclosure Statements

+ New chat Previous 7 Days □ AI in Writing Classes Previous 30 Days D New chat July Food & African American Cul June □ AI & Food Essay Prompts Candy Quality Debate Rhetorical Analysis: Duncan's May 🟳 Composition Class Pol 🖉 🖻

Tweety struggles with pronur

□ New chat

ペ Upgrade to Plus

NEW

18

m

D jduncan@gsu.edu

JD

You are an experienced instructor for a college level introduction to composition course. I want you to ask me two questions: who is the audience? what is the scope of usage allowed? Then, I want you to write a policy for acceptable use of large-language models in the composition class.

Great! Before we start, I'd like to ask you a couple of questions:

007

.....

1. Who is the intended audience for your composition course? Are your students primarily college freshmen or upperclassmen, or are they a mix of both?

 Regarding the scope of usage allowed, are there any specific guidelines or restrictions on what sources or materials your students are allowed to use when completing assignments? For example, are they limited to using only academic sources, or are they permitted to use online resources such as Wikipedia or personal blogs?

Once I have a better understanding of your intended audience and the scope of permissible usage for the course, I can draft a policy for acceptable use of large-language models.

W

Thank you!

Send a message

Free Research Preview. ChatGPT may produce inaccurate information about people, places, or facts. <u>ChatGPT August 3 Version</u>

+ New chat

- Previous 7 Days
- □ AI in Writing Classes

Previous 30 Days

□ New chat

July

Food & African American Cul

June

- □ AI & Food Essay Prompts
- Candy Quality Debate

Rhetorical Analysis: Duncan's

May

🟳 Composition Class Pol 🖉 🖻

Tweety struggles with pronur

□ New chat

A Upgrade to Plus

jduncan@gsu.edu

NEW

G

Thank you for providing that context. Based on your description, I recommend the following $\Box \ \Box \ \nabla$ policy for acceptable use of large-language models in your composition class:

- 1. Large-language models (LLMs) such as GPT-3 are permitted for use in this course to assist with brainstorming, generating ideas, and checking grammar and spelling errors.
- 2. LLMs should be used as a tool to aid in the writing process, not as a replacement for critical thinking and original writing. Students must always be able to articulate and defend the ideas presented in their assignments, regardless of whether they used an LLM.
- 3. Students are required to disclose any use of LLMs in their assignments by providing citations and acknowledging the use of the technology in their writing.
- 4. While LLMs are permitted, other forms of plagiarism, such as copying and pasting from unattributed sources, are strictly prohibited and will result in academic penalties.
- 5. Students are encouraged to seek feedback and assistance from the instructor or writing center to help improve their writing skills and learn how to effectively use LLMs as a tool in the writing process.

By implementing these guidelines, you can ensure that your students are able to use LLMs in a responsible and ethical manner while still developing their own writing skills. Good luck with your course!

DL	This course in fully online. Please include reference to that in the policy	S Regenerate
Ser	nd a message	>
	Free Research Preview. ChatGPT may produce inaccurate information about people, places, or facts. ChatGPT Au	gust 3 Version
🔌 🝙 🚝 📻 🚍 🗖		

Transparency in Assignment Instructions

	🔒 ach	ieve.macmillanlearning.com	Ċ	<u>ن</u> (¹)			
Mriting			0	Final Paper Due: Su			
Content and settings within this course have been restricted and can only be changed from within the Section Manager.							
	PROMPT	SUBMISSIONS REPORTS					
Draft Source Check Settings 2 Source Check(s) allowed during drafting 1 Source Check at draft submission		essay? Why or why n c. What hallucinations words, what parts of the text. d. What rhetorical elem	g your thesis and sentence om iCollege that you're all and take it apart to see l and the see of	owed to use for this how the author mesis statement for cument so I can see esis statement works ectiveness of the atement? In other and can't be proven by the most important yould I like to replace 1 which evaluates esis statement es the author uses. It I. ach paragraph of your ragraph of the essay.			

Transparency in Responses

SU	BMISSIONS REPORTS	
	+ Introduction	
	+ Logical Appeals	
	+ Thesis	

Writer Instructions

Using the feedback you received from peer reviewers and me--as well as your own continued thinking about the assignment and the position you are arguing--revise your essay. Keep the assignment prompt in mind, and remember to read through the rubric. For your MLA-style formatting and works cited page, see Documenting Sources: MLA Style in Writer's Help.

At this point, you may NOT use AI in your essay.

Writing Reflection Questions

- Agree/Disagree Poll I know the criteria that will be used for giving me feedback.
- Free Response One piece of evidence I want to call attention to in my essay is...
- Free Response One thing I want my reader to understand is...
- Free Response The primary argument I'm making is...
- Free Response How did you use AI in developing this final draft? Remember that you must disclose AI usage. You should also submit any AI generated material as the last page of your essay; label it as AI WRITING HELP.

🔢 Final Paper Due: Sun, Jul 9

(?)



Entering the Conversation

Modeling





Equity

Students can use AI to help them understand the terms and language of the genre.

AI HELP

No, anecdotes and vivid language are not the same, although they can be related and used together in writing to enhance the overall impact of a piece. Here's the difference

1. **Anecdotes**:

- Anecdotes are short, specific, and often personal stories or examples that writers use to illustrate a point, provide context, or make their writing more relatable.

- They can be used to add a human element to an argument, making it more persuasive or engaging.

- Anecdotes are particularly useful for connecting with the reader on an emotional or experiential level.

2. **Vivid Language**:

- Vivid language refers to the use of descriptive and evocative words and phrases that create vivid mental images and engage the reader's senses.

- It aims to make the writing more colorful, descriptive, and immersive.

Vivid language can be used to point a detailed picture, convey emotions, as eat a

	General Comment •
ŀ	lighlighted Writing
	AI HELP No, anecdotes and vivid language are not the same, although they can be… Show More
-	Reviewer Feedback lice Job 'his was a very good way to use the AI to help

 $\langle \rangle$



Students can use AI to develop relevant and appropriate writing prompts.

As you've probably figured out by the topics for essay 1, you'll be writing about food based issues with essay 2 and 3 as well. For essay 2, you should develop an argument based on the ideas that interested you in the essays you were assigned to read. Here are some suggestions to get you started:

- Develop an argument about the relationship between food and a specific culture.
- Explain how restaurants define a neighborhood (use specifics).
- Choose a food topic that is considered taboo and explain why it should be discussed.
- Explain how food is part of a specific religion or how a religion affected food.
- What role does commerce have in pushing certain foods on us?
- These are just some ideas. Your choice is up to, so take a look at the essays I've provided and use them as inspiration.

How did AI affect your development of this topic? Post the topics exactly as AI suggested them to you, and explain how you came up with the one you finally drafted.

ChatGPT

Certainly! Here are three prompts to explore the intricate relationship between food and culture:

Cultural Significance of Food: Delve into the ways in which food serves as a reflection of culture. How do the ingredients, preparation methods, and rituals associated with a particular cuisine reveal insights into the values, beliefs, and history of a culture? Provide specific examples from different cultures to illustrate your points.

Food's Role in Celebrations and Traditions: Investigate how food plays a central role in cultural celebrations and traditions. Explore how specific dishes or meals are tied to festivals, ceremonies, and special occasions. Discuss the symbolic meanings behind these foods and their importance in preserving cultural heritage.

Cultural Fusion in Food: Examine the phenomenon of cultural fusion in culinary practices. How do cultures influence and inspire one another in the realm of food? Discuss the emergence of fusion cuisines, the blending of flavors and techniques, and the impact of globalization on the diversity of food choices. Share examples of successful cultural fusion in the culinary world.

I merged the idea of the first prompt with one of the ones provided in the discussion. . . " Explain how restaurants define a neighborhood"

What thesis statements did AI generate for you? What did you like and not like about each one? I didn't use AI for this step.

Draft Comparisons

Content and settings within this course have been restricted and can only be changed from within the Section Manager.

Review Ready Submissions

 (\leftarrow) Writing

Prompt 1: In "The Rules of Fried Chicken on a Boat," Jen Rice explores the cultural significance of fried chicken and how it has evolved over time. Do you believe cultural appropriation is an issue when it comes to food, particularly dishes like fried chicken? Write an argumentative essay discussing the ethical implications of cultural appropriation in the culinary world, using fried chicken as a case study. I could explore the culture from the article written by Rice and actually compare it to southern foods in the article "we shall not move" that gave a tradition behind African American culture. Its not enough to give out a case study.

Prompt 2: Rice emphasizes the importance of context and environment in enjoying fried chicken. Do you agree that the setting and atmosphere play a crucial role in the overall experience of eating fried chicken? Write an argumentative essay discussing the impact of ambiance and environment on our enjoyment of food, with a specific focus on fried chicken. This actually wouldn't be a bad prompt. Rice article tells how an ambiance and when is the right place to eat chicken. Through Harris article. Slavery created this foods that were influenced by the Owners and there were no really ambiance that came from this food until the future happened.

Argument essay

Throughout decades, there has been a massive improvement and shift toward the food that represents the African American culture. Food is known to gather people together in a family or celebratory matter. Food holds an immersive historical significance in the African American culture that served as a way to promote historical culinary traditions that helped shaped food into a powerful tradition. The fusion of African, and European culinary traditions during slavery shaped the development of African American cuisine, which resulted in a rich tradition that not only reflects the resilience and creativity of a second-largest minority community but also serves as a form of resistance, identity, and empowerment throughout African American history. With the fusion of foods and cultures that were mixed with European standards during slavery and the civil war, it was preserved and locked between its people which eventually became sacred. The stereotypes and challenges still exist to this day but have grown significantly to where everybody of different cultures is enduring these delicious foods.

(?)

One of the most famous dishes of the South is fried chicken. Fried chicken is perfect for any big dinner like a family reunion or even for a little boat ride as the one Jenn Rice took. This cultural dish is world known and can be made in several ways. Jenn Rice the 2回

Mark Ready to Send

Students can use AI to see samples of what they're expected to do AND to evaluate those samples.

I know the criteria that will be used for giving me feedback. Strongly Agree

?

Paste the text of the AI generated thesis statement. Now, explain why this is or is not an evaluative thesis. In "We Shall Not Be Moved" by Jessica B. Harris, the author employs a compelling combination of historical allusions, emotional resonance, and vivid imagery to craft a rhetorically intricate narrative that celebrates the unwavering resilience and collective strength of marginalized communities throughout history, thereby effectively reinforcing the power of solidarity in the face of adversity.

Do you agree with what the AI says about the effectiveness of the essay? Why or why not? Yes. I enjoyed the essay and I feel like I did resonate with the allusions, emoitons and images the AI thesis references.

What hallucinations can you spot in this thesis statement? In other words, what parts of this thesis are made up and can't be proven by the text.

In theory, the points all are a bit made up. They are all so vague to me, and a bit too general to be able to effectively defend in a paper.

What rhetorical elements does the AI think are the most important in this essay? Do you agree with these OR what would I like to replace them with?

"Historical allusions, emotional resonance, and vivid imagery." I agree with them in theory, as they are not wrong. And I would probably choose a similar rheotical device as "emotional resonance", and I might even steal vivid imagery. But overall, I think I wuold choose different points to hit for this paper.

Hide Side Panel

Writer Instructions

DRAFT 1: This is NOT a draft! It's a step in the process!

For this step, you'll be developing your thesis and sentence outline for essay 1. Here's what you need to do:

- Select one of the essays from iCollege that you're allowed to use for this assignment. Read the essay and take it apart to see how the author develops hi or her argument.
- Ask Chat GPT (or the LLM of your choice to write a thesis statement for you for this essay. Copy and paste that into you document so I can see what it created; then, evaluate whether or not the thesis statement works by answering the following questions:
 - a. How is this thesis evaluating the essay?
 - b. Do I agree with what the AI says about the effectiveness of the essay? Why or why not?
 - c. What hallucinations can I spot in



Critical Thinking & Reflection



Reflection





\$

Jessica Harris's essay "We Shall Not Be Moved" uses lots of great examples and her personal stories and really helps readers understand why Civil Rights and food were connected.

Thank you for sharing your thesis statement. Let's analyze it and work on improving it.

Your thesis statement should provide a clear and concise overview of the main argument or point you intend to make in your essay. Based on your statement, here's some feedback and recommendations for improvement:

- 1. Clarity and Specificity: Your thesis statement needs to be more specific and clear. It mentions Jessica Harris's essay, but it doesn't specify the main argument or the specific rhetorical elements you plan to analyze.
- Rhetorical Analysis Focus: In a rhetorical analysis essay, it's essential to mention the rhetorical strategies or devices the author uses to convey their message effectively. Consider mentioning specific rhetorical elements like ethos, pathos, logos, tone, imagery, or figurative language that Jessica Harris employs in her essay.
- 3. Argument Precision: Your thesis should clearly state your argument or interpretation of how the author uses rhetoric to convey their message. What is the main point you're trying to make about the connection between Civil Rights and food in Jessica Harris's essay?

Here's a revised thesis statement that incorporates these recommendations:

G Regenerate

Students can use AI to evaluate their work. Then, instructors can ask them to evaluate the experience.

0 6 7

Ask students to think critically about what the AI produces/ "question authority"

î (← Writing	?	Final Paper Due: Sun, Jun 18
Conte	nt and settings within this course have been restricted and can only be changed from within the Section Manager.		
Review Re	eady Submissions	<	> Viewed by Student
	✓ Reflection		Hide Side Panel 📎
	I know the criteria that will be used for giving me feedback. Strongly Agree Paste the text of the AI generated thesis statement. Now, explain how is this thesis evaluating the essay? In "We Shall Not Be Moved" by Jessica B. Harris, the author employs rhetorical strategies such as vivid imagery, historical allusions, and personal anecdotes to evoke a powerful sense of resilience and collective identity among African Americans, compelling readers to reflect on the enduring spirit of the community in the face of systemic oppression and injustice.		collapse Writer Instructions DRAFT 1: This is NOT a draft! It's a step in the process! For this step, you'll be developing your thesis and sentence outline for essay 1. Here's what you need to do:
	Do I agree with what the AI says about the effectiveness of the essay? Why or why not? I don't believe the essay was effective in mentioning exactly how the Civil Rights Movement impacted the evolution of the African American diet.		 Select one of the essays from iCollege that you're allowed to use for this assignment. Read the essay and take it apart to see how the author develops his or her argument. Ask Chat GPT (or the LLM of your choice)
	What hallucinations can I spot in this thesis statement? In other words, what parts of this thesis are made up and can't be proven by the text. The thesis highlights the "resilience" of African Americans which is not what the essay is about. The essay emphasizes the evolution of the African American diet.		to write a thesis statement for you for this essay. Copy and paste that into your document so I can see what it created; then, evaluate whether or not the thesis statement works by answering the following questions:
	What rhetorical elements does the AI think are the most important in this essay? Do I agree with these OR what would I like to replace them with? The AI thinks the historical allusions, personal anecdotes, and vivid imagery is the most important essay. I agree that the essay employs historical and vivid imagery, yet I would replace the personal anecdote with the fact the author fails to focus		a. How is this thesis evaluating the essay?b. Do I agree with what the AI says about the effectiveness of the essay? Why or why not?

c. What hallucinations can I spot in

on the central topic.

When asked about the role of women in Gilgamesh, Chat GPT gives <u>this response</u>. Your job in this assignment is to prove Chat GPT wrong - or at least biased. For each of the characters listed, give a revised interpretation for how these women and their interactions show that women in this story are actually being rewritten as minor characters in what was once a matriarchal society. Unlike Chat GPT, you'll need to use specific examples from the text to support your claims. You may also use the following 2 articles to prove your point. (*This assignment will work well for students who like argument and debate and who feel comfortable exploring new technologies.*)

- Hodges, Kate, Warriors, Witches, Women: Mythology's Fiercest Females, White Lion, 2020, pp 203-207.
- Sonik, Karen, "Rethinking Women as Minor Characters in the Epic of Gilgamesh," Journal of the American Oriental Society, vol. 141, issue, 4, 01 October 2021, pp. 779-802.
- For this essay, you may not use Chat GPT other than the response I gave you. Remember that your job is to argue against the AI! Failure to disclose LLM usage will result in a 0 for the assignment.

Chat GPT Response Generated 19 August 2021, Jennifer Duncan, prompt writer.

THE PROMPT: You are a college student studying *The Epic of Gilgamesh* for the first time. What role do women play in Gilgmesh? What does this say about the role of women in Sumerian culture?

THE RESPONSE

In "The Epic of Gilgamesh," women play various roles that provide insights into the role of women in Sumerian culture. While the epic primarily focuses on the adventures of Gilgamesh and his friend Enkidu, the female characters in the story serve as complex and influential figures who contribute to the narrative in significant ways. Here are some key roles that women play in the epic and what they reveal about the role of women in Sumerian culture:

1. **Shamhat: The Temple Priestess**

Shamhat is a sacred temple priestess who plays a crucial role in initiating Enkidu into civilization. She seduces Enkidu and introduces him to the ways of human society. Through this interaction, Shamhat symbolizes the power of civilization and the role of women in nurturing and guiding men into the cultural norms of the time. Her character showcases the reverence for temple priestesses and the importance of their roles as intermediaries between the divine and human roalms.

2. **Ishtar: The Goddess of Love and War**

Ishtar is a powerful goddess who is associated with both love and war. She seeks Gilgamesh as a potential lover, but he rejects her advances, leading her to unleash the Bull of Heaven as punishment. Ishtar's actions and interactions with mortal characters emphasize the idea that even divine figures can be capricious and unpredictable. Her role reflects the belief in the influence of deities in human affairs and how interactions with these powerful entities could impact individuals and society.

3. **Siduri: The Wise Alewife**

Siduri is an alewife, or tavern keeper, who provides Gilgamesh with guidance and advice during his journey. Her character is a representation of wisdom and practical knowledge, and she advises Gilgamesh to appreciate the simple pleasures of life. Siduri's role highlights the value placed on experienced and knowledgeable women in Sumerian society. Her advice also encourages Gilgamesh to embrace his humanity and reflect on the impermanence of life.

The roles of these female characters in "The Epic of Gilgamesh" reflect the multifaceted nature of women's contributions to Sumerian culture. They serve as representatives of diverse aspects of life, from the spiritual and nurturing role of temple priestesses to the divine and powerful role of goddesses, and the wise and practical role of everyday women. While the roles of women in the epic may not always be centered around political or societal leadership, they

Professor Duncan's comments on this response:

What this answer does well: While this is very elementary level writing, you'll notice that the answer is given in traditional thesis and support structured essay. Of course, students writing at a college level would be expected to produce a more argumentative and nuanced thesis – one that connected the cultural meaning of the work to its literary technique – rather than this simple announcement.

This response could also be useful in helping students identify the main female characters in the story and pointing them to the appropriate sections of the text to investigate for themselves.

What this answer does poorly: A formal essay shouldn't have this type of numbered list of headings. Instead, clear topic sentences should tie back to the thesis statement and transition from one idea to the next.

This response contains vague summaries and generalizations. It lacks any specifics from the text to support its claims (notice there are no internal citations, quotations, or paraphrases). The response makes claims but does not prove those claims with evidence from the text, nor does it contain any historical or cultural details to support its claims of what Sumerian culture believed.

As you create your own counter-response, you'll want to make sure that you do better work





Relevant Assignments

- Am I creating timely assignments, rather that relying on what I've used in the past?
- Am I teaching them how to use this tool beyond my class?

Require students to use recent sources (post 2021).

🔌 💲 🖬 📿 🚍 🚯 Sat Sep 30 5:19 PM ookmarks Window Help D F S CA chat.openai.com You have just read Julia Reed's Essay "The Great Leveler." JD Give me three possible writing prompts for an argumentative essay based on ideas connected to Reed's essay 0 6 7 I apologize for any confusion, but my previous response was inaccurate. I don't have the capability to read specific essays, books, or documents like Julia Reed's "The Great Leveler" because my knowledge is based on a diverse range of sources up until September 2021, but it doesn't include access to specific, copyrighted texts. However, I can still provide you with three general writing prompts based on common themes or ideas often explored in essays related to Southern culture, which may align with the themes in Julia Reed's work: 1. Southern Hospitality Revisited: Explore the concept of Southern hospitality as depicted in various literary works and essays. Argue whether Southern hospitality remains a relevant and enduring cultural trait in the South today, or if it has evolved or eroded over time. Discuss the factors that contribute to the perception of Southern hospitality and its impact on Southern identity. 2. The Culinary Tapestry of the South: Investigate the role of food and cuisine in Southern culture, drawing from Julia Reed's work as well as other sources. Argue how Southern food traditions have shaped the region's identity and contributed to its reputation as a culinary hub. Discuss whether the preservation and adaptation of Southern food traditions are \checkmark essential for maintaining the cultural heritage of the South. G Regenerate

Give them AI skills to take beyond your class.

You are a copy editor. You are tasked with improving the punctuation and grammar of the follow writing sample with nominal changes in wording. When you make corrections, also provide a full list of the changes you have made to the essay.